STATE OF MICHIGAN CIRCUIT COURT FOR THE 30TH JUDICIAL CIRCUIT INGHAM COUNTY

ELIZABETH BROWN, TAMEKA RAMSEY, EMMA KINNARD, HON. JUANITA HENRY, BARBARA FORD, EDITH LEE-PAYNE, EVELYN FOREMAN, JACQUELINE STEINGOLD, LESLIE LITTLE, MICHELLE MARTINEZ, SUZANNE SATTLER IHM, BARBARA DAVENPORT, IRENE WRIGHT, PATRICK O'CONNOR, PAUL JORDAN, MICHAEL MERRIWEATHER, MARCIA SIKORA, AHMINA MAXEY, MARYION LEE, LISA OLIVER-KING, KIMBERLY SPRING, BRENDA REEBER, GEORGE REEBER, DAVID FREDERICK, JOHN DAVID IVERS, LORI CHRISTENSON, BETSY COFFIA and JAMES CLANCEY,

Case No. 11-685-CZ

Hon. Rosemarie E. Aquilina

Plaintiffs,

ANSWER AND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES TO COMPLAINT

v

RICHARD D. SNYDER, as Governor of the STATE OF MICHIGAN, and ANDREW DILLON, as Treasurer of the STATE OF MICHIGAN,

Defendants.

John C. Philo (P52721) Anthony D. Paris (P71525) Co-Counsel - Attorneys for Plaintiffs Sugar Law Center 4605 Cass Ave., 2nd Fl. Detroit, MI 48201 (313) 993-4505/Fax: (313) 887-8470 Herbert A. Sanders (P43031) Co-Counsel - Attorneys for Plaintiffs The Sanders Law Firm PC 615 Griswold St., Ste. 913 Detroit, MI 48226 (313) 962-0099/Fax: (313) 962-0044 Richard G. Mack, Jr. (P58657) Keith D. Flynn (P74192) Robert D. Fetter (P68816) Co-Counsel - Attorneys for Plaintiffs Miller Cohen PLC 600 W. Lafayette Blvd., 4th Fl. Detroit, MI 48226 (313) 964-4454/Fax: (313) 964-4490

Darius Charney Co-Counsel - Attorneys for Plaintiffs Center for Constitutional Rights 666 Broadway, 7th Fl. New York, NY 10012 Julie H. Hurwitz (P34720)
William H. Goodman (P14173)
Brandon M. Stump (P74418)
Co-Counsel - Attorneys for Plaintiffs
Goodman & Hurwitz PC on behalf of
the Detroit & Michigan National
Lawyers Guild
1394 E. Jefferson Ave.
Detroit, MI 48207
(313) 567-6170/Fax: (313) 567-4827

Michael F. Murphy (P29213)
Jennifer M. Jackson (P67126)
Assistant Attorneys General
Attorneys for Defendants
State Operations Division
P.O. Box 30754
Lansing, MI 48909
(517) 373-1162/Fax: (517) 373-2060

ANSWER TO COMPLAINT

Defendants Richard Snyder, Governor, and Andrew Dillon, State Treasurer (together, Defendants), by Attorney General Bill Schuette and Assistant Attorney General Michael F. Murphy, set forth the following for its Answer to Plaintiffs' Complaint:

NATURE OF CLAIMS

- 1. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 1 for the reason that they are untrue.
- MCL 141.1501 et seq. speaks for itself and no answer is required.
 Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.

- $3.\,$ Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 3 for the reason that they are untrue.
- 4. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 4 for the reason that they are untrue.

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 5. Paragraph 5 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required.

 Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
 - 6. Defendants admit the allegations contained in paragraph 6.

PARTIES

- 7. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 7 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 8. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 8 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 9. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 9 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 10. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 10 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 11. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 11 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.

- 12. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 12 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 13. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 13 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 14. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 14 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 15. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 15 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 16. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 16 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 17. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 17 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 18. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 18 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.

- 19. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 19 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 20. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 20 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 21. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 21 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 22. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 22 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 23. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 23 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 24. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 24 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 25. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 25 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.

- 26. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 26 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 27. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 27 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 28. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 28 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 29. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 29 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 30. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 30 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 31. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 31 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 32. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 32 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.

- 33. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 33 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 34. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 34 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
 - 35. Defendants admit the allegations contained in paragraph 35.
 - 36. Defendants admit the allegations contained in paragraph 36.

COMMON FACTS

- 37. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 37 for the reason that they are untrue.
- 38. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 38 for the reason that they are untrue.
- 39. Paragraph 39 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 40. Act 72, Public Acts of 1990 speaks for itself and no answer is necessary.

 Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 41. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 41 for the reason that they are untrue.

- 42. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 42 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
 - 43. Defendants admit the allegations contained in paragraph 43.
- 44. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 44 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 45. The Act speaks for itself and no answer is required. Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 46. The Act speaks for itself and no answer is required. Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 47. The Act speaks for itself and no answer is required. Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
 - 48. The Act speaks for itself and no answer is required. Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 49. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 49 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.
- 50. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 50 for the reason that they are untrue.
- 51. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 51 for the reason that they are untrue.

- 52. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 52 for the reason that they are untrue.
- 53. Paragraph 53 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any remaining factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 54. Paragraph 54 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any remaining factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 55. Paragraph 55 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any remaining factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 56. Paragraph 56 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any remaining factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 57. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 57 for the reason that they are untrue.
- 58. Paragraph 58 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any remaining factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 59. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 59 for the reason that they are untrue.

- 60. Paragraph 60 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any remaining factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 61. Paragraph 61 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any remaining factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 62. Paragraph 62 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any remaining factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 63. The Act speaks for itself and no answer is required. Defendants deny any remaining factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 64. Paragraph 64 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any remaining factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 65. The Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 65 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.

COUNT I

- 66. Defendants incorporate their answers in paragraphs 1 65 as if fully set forth here.
- 67. The Constitution speaks for itself and no answer is required. Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.

- 68. Paragraph 68 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 69. Paragraph 69 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 70. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 70 for the reason that they are untrue.
- 71. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 71 for the reason that they are untrue.

WHEREFORE, Defendants pray this Honorable Court enter its verdict of no cause of action in favor of Defendants and award Defendants' costs and attorney fees wrongfully incurred.

COUNT II

- 72. Defendants incorporate their answers in paragraphs 1 71 as if fully set forth here.
- 73. The Constitution speaks for itself and no answer is required. Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 74. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 74 for the reason that they are untrue.
- 75. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 75 for the reason that they are untrue.

76. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 76 for the reason that they are untrue.

WHEREFORE, Defendants pray this Honorable Court enter its verdict of no cause of action in favor of Defendants and award Defendants' costs and attorney fees wrongfully incurred.

COUNT III

- 77. Defendants incorporate their answers in paragraphs 1 76 as if fully set forth here.
- 78. The Constitution speaks for itself and no answer is required. Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 79. Paragraph 79 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 80. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 80 for the reason that they are untrue.
- 81. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 81 for the reason that they are untrue.

WHEREFORE, Defendants pray this Honorable Court enter its verdict of no cause of action in favor of Defendants and award Defendants' costs and attorney fees wrongfully incurred.

COUNT IV

- 82. Defendants incorporate their answers in paragraphs 1 81 as if fully set forth here.
- 83. The Constitution speaks for itself and no answer is required. Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 84. Paragraph 84 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 85. Paragraph 85 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 86. Paragraph 86 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 87. Paragraph 87 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.
- 88. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 88 for the reason that they are untrue.

WHEREFORE, Defendants pray this Honorable Court enter its verdict of no cause of action in favor of Defendants and award Defendants' costs and attorney fees wrongfully incurred.

COUNT V

89. Defendants incorporate their answers in paragraphs 1 - 88 as if fully set forth here.

90. Paragraph 90 states a legal conclusion and therefore no answer is required. Defendants deny any remaining factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.

91. Defendants neither admit nor deny the allegations in paragraph 91 for they lack sufficient information to form a belief as to the truth of the matters asserted.

92. Defendants deny the allegations contained in paragraph 92 for the reason that they are untrue.

93. The Act speaks for itself and no answer is required. Defendants deny any factual allegations for the reason that they are untrue.

WHEREFORE, Defendants pray this Honorable Court enter its verdict of no cause of action in favor of Defendants and award Defendants' costs and attorney fees wrongfully incurred.

Bill Schuette

Attorney General

Michael F. Murphy (

Assistant Attorney General

Attorneys for Defendants

State Operations Division

P.O. Box 30754

Lansing, MI 48909

(517) 373-1162

Dated: July 20, 2011

AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES

- 1. Plaintiffs' Complaint fails to state a claim upon which relief can be granted.
 - 2. Plaintiffs' Complaint is barred by sovereign immunity.
 - 3. The Court lacks subject matter jurisdiction over Plaintiffs' claims.
- 4. Defendants reserve the right to amend or add affirmative defenses that may become known through discovery.

Bill Schuette

Attorney General

Michael F. Murphy (P29213)

Assistant Attorney General

Attorneys for Defendants

State Operations Division

P.O. Box 30754

Lansing, MI 48909

(517) 373-1162

Dated: July 20, 2011

PROOF OF SERVICE

The undersigned certifies that on July 20, 2011, a copy of the above document was served on the attorneys of record in the above-captioned case by mailing the same to them at their respective addresses, with first class postage fully prepaid.

Bobli Ballenger Legal Secretary

2011-0015076-A/Brown, Elizabeth v Snyder\Answer & Aff Defenses v3.doc